

The Regional Municipality of York

Committee of the Whole
Transportation Services
May 14, 2020

Report of the Commissioner of Transportation Services

Award of Consulting Engineering Services for Various Structure Replacements and Rehabilitations

1. Recommendations

1. Council approve the award of contract for consulting engineering services for various structural replacements and rehabilitations to GHD Limited, pursuant to Request for Proposal P-19-307, at a total cost of \$2,165,148, excluding HST.
2. Council authorize the Commissioner of Transportation Services to execute the agreement on behalf of the Region.

2. Summary

This report seeks Council approval to award and enter into a contract with GHD Limited for consulting engineering services for various structural replacements and rehabilitations, under Request for Proposal (RFP) P-19-307.

The Region's current Purchasing Bylaw (2017-30) requires Council authorization to award RFPs where the total cost exceeds \$2,000,000.

Key Points:

- 14 structures have been identified in need of replacement or rehabilitation on various roads throughout York Region
- Structures chosen for replacement or rehabilitation were selected through field investigation and analysis
- Construction for the structural work included in this assignment is planned for 2021 and 2022

3. Background

The Region's current Purchasing Bylaw (2017-30) remains in effect

Council approved the enactment of the Region's new Procurement Bylaw in January 2020 to replace the current Purchasing Bylaw (2017-30). Under the new Procurement Bylaw, the Chief Administrative Officer will be able to award all RFPs, provided the award is within budget. However, the implementation of the new Procurement Bylaw has been delayed due to the current COVID-19 situation and therefore, the Region's current Purchasing Bylaw (2017-30) remains in effect and requires Council authorization to award RFPs where the total cost exceeds \$2,000,000.

The Region undertakes biennial structural inspections and prioritizes structures for rehabilitation or replacement

The Region undertakes biennial structural inspections of all 417 of the Region's bridges, culverts and retaining walls as set out in the *Public Transportation and Highway Improvement Act*. These inspections are "close-up" visual assessments of each element of a structure, as well as material defects, performance deficiencies and maintenance and rehabilitation needs. After the structural inspections are complete, structures are prioritized for rehabilitation or replacement.

4. Analysis

March 2018, the Region issued a Request for Pre-Qualification for detailed design and engineering services for various structural replacements

In March 2018, Request for Pre-Qualification PQ-18-124 was issued for two assignments. Eleven firms expressed interest:

- Jacobs (formerly CH2M Hill Canada Limited)
- GHD Limited
- LEA Consulting Ltd.
- Morrison Hershfield Limited
- Stephenson Engineering Limited
- SNC-Lavalin Inc.
- IBI Group Professional Services
- HDR Corporation
- Associated Engineering Ltd.
- CIMA Canada Inc.
- Gannett Fleming Canada ULC

The submissions were evaluated in April 2018 and the top four firms were pre-qualified:

- Jacobs (formerly CH2M Hill Canada Limited)
- GHD Limited
- LEA Consulting Ltd.
- Morrison Hershfield Limited

In May 2019, Jacobs was awarded the first assignment to provide consulting engineering services under RFP P-18-237. As per the terms of the Request for Pre-Qualification, the successful respondent to the first RFP is to be excluded from submitting a proposal during the second RFP. Therefore, Jacobs was not invited to submit a proposal for this assignment under RFP P-19-307.

December 2019, the Region issued a Request for Proposal for detailed design and engineering services for various structural replacements and rehabilitations

In December 2019, RFP P-19-307, including 14 structures consisting of bridges and culverts recommended for structural rehabilitation or replacement, was issued to the three remaining pre-qualified proponents and all three submitted proposals.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system with a weighting of 80% for the technical component and 20% for the financial component. The proponents had to achieve a minimum score of 48 points out of 80 to proceed to the next step of having their financial envelopes opened. All three firms met this criterion.

The proposals were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, bylaws and practices. The proponents, their technical and financial scores and proposed upset limit fees are shown in Table 1.

Table 1
Evaluation Summary

| Firm | Technical Score (80%) | Financial Score (20%) | Total Score (100%) | Upset Limit Fee (excluding HST) | Cost per Technical Point |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|
| LEA Consulting | 58.12 | 15.64 | 73.76 | \$2,769,116.26 | \$47,644.81 |
| GHD Limited | 49.65 | 20.00 | 69.65 | \$2,165,148.00 | \$43,608.22 |
| Morrison Hershfield Limited | 50.87 | 16.97 | 67.84 | \$2,551,923.70 | \$50,165.59 |

The proposal from GHD Limited achieved the lowest cost per technical point in response to Request for Proposal P-19-307

Although the proposal from Lea Consulting received the highest total score, the proposal from GHD Limited achieved the lowest price per technical point. The terms of the RFP state where two or more bidders are within five points of the highest overall score, a dollar cost per technical point methodology shall be applied to determine the bidder to whom the contract shall be awarded. As such, GHD Limited is the successful proponent pursuant to the requirements of the RFP and the Region's Purchasing Bylaw.

GHD Limited was pre-qualified and is capable of delivering this work. The submission achieved a good technical score and demonstrated their experience and specialized knowledge required for this assignment.

5. Financial

The upset limit fee submitted by GHD Limited for consulting engineering services is \$2,165,148, excluding HST.

Funds are available in the approved 2020 Capital Budget. All expenditures for this assignment will be funded from 75% tax levy and 25% development charges.

6. Local Impact

The 14 structures proposed for rehabilitation or replacement are located at the following locations:

- Kennedy Road, 1.6 kilometres north of Mount Albert Road, Town of East Gwillimbury
- Glenwoods Avenue, 1.5 kilometres east of The Queensway, Town of Georgina
- Highway 27, 401 metres north of Lloydtown-Aurora Road, Township of King
- Keele Street, 100 metres north of King Road, Township of King
- King Road, 1.3 kilometres east of Keele Street, Township of King
- King Road, 100 metres west of Keele Street, Township of King
- Lloydtown-Aurora Road, 1.5 kilometres east of Jane Street Township of King
- Lloydtown-Aurora Road, 1.1 kilometres east of Jane Street, Township of King
- McCowan Road, 1.3 kilometres north of 16th Avenue, City of Markham
- Yonge Street, 690 metres north of Steeles Avenue, City of Markham
- Mulock Drive, 700 metres east of Bayview Avenue, Town of Newmarket
- Elgin Mills Road, 800 metres east of Bayview Avenue, City of Richmond Hill

- King Road, 2.0 kilometres east of Bathurst Street, City of Richmond Hill
- Keele Street, 100 metres north of Langstaff Road, City of Vaughan

The design assignment should have minimal impact on local businesses, traffic and pedestrians and will be limited to short duration lane closures for short-term, pre-construction field investigation work.

7. Conclusion

Proposals from three firms were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, bylaws and practices. The proposal submitted by GHD Limited achieved the lowest price per technical point and is the successful proponent pursuant to the requirements of the RFP and the terms of the Region's Purchasing Bylaw.

Staff recommends the contract for consulting engineering services for various structural replacements and rehabilitation be awarded to GHD Limited, as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-19-307, for a total cost of \$2,165,148, excluding HST.

For more information on this report, please contact Salim Alibhai, Director of Capital Planning and Delivery at 1-877-464-9675 ext. 75229. Accessible formats or communication supports are available upon request.

Recommended by: **Paul Jankowski**
Commissioner of Transportation Services

Approved for Submission: **Bruce Macgregor**
Chief Administrative Officer

April 24, 2020
10685539