

Legislative Services Michael de Rond 905-726-4771 clerks@aurora.ca

Town of Aurora 100 John West Way, Box 1000 Aurora, ON L4G 6J1

May 29, 2020

**Delivered by email** regional.clerk@york.ca

Christopher Raynor, Regional Clerk The Regional Municipality of York 17250 Yonge Street Newmarket, ON L3Y 6Z1

Dear Mr. Raynor:

Re: Town of Aurora Council Resolution of May 26, 2020 Decision on Regional Fire Service Study

Please be advised that this matter was considered by Council at its meeting held on May 26, 2020, and in this regard Council adopted the following resolution:

- 1. That Report No. CS20-007 be received; and
- 2. That Council supports proceeding with a study of the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service; and
- 3. That the Town Clerk be directed to circulate the Town's decision to York Region and all York Region municipalities.

The above is for your consideration and any attention deemed necessary.

Yours sincerely.

Michael de Rond

Town Clerk

The Corporation of the Town of Aurora

MdR/lb

Copy: All York Region Municipalities

May 22, 2020

Chris Raynor, Regional Clerk Regional Municipality of York 17250 Yonge Street Newmarket, ON L3Y 6Z1

Dear C. Raynor:

Legal & Council Support Services Tel: 905-478-3821 Fax: 905-478-2808

Fernando Lamanna, B.A., Dipl. M. M., CMO

flamanna@eastgwillimbury.ca

Municipal Clerk

[SENT VIA EMAIL]

#### **RE: REGIONAL FIRE SERVICE REVIEW**

For your information and records, at its electronic meeting held on May 20, 2020 the Council of the Town of East Gwillimbury enacted as follows:

BE IT RESOLVED THAT Emergency & Community Safety Services memorandum, dated May 20, 2020, regarding Council Consideration for Regional Fire Service Review, be received; and

THAT a letter be provided from the Town of East Gwillimbury indicating that Council does not support proceeding with a study on the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service; and

THAT Council reiterate our direction to the Fire Chief to continue to work with our municipal neighbours and partners on projects that deliver positive results, efficiencies and possible operational savings as outlined in the Collaboration and Innovation Report and our joint Fire Master Plans.

If you have any further questions feel free to contact the undersigned.

Yours truly,

Fernando Lamanna, B.A., Dipl. M. M., CMO Municipal Clerk

cc: Lower Tier Municipal Clerks in the Regional Municipality of York

From: Regional Clerk

**Subject:** FW: Regional Council Composition, Regional Fire Service

From: Carolyn Lance [mailto:clance@georgina.ca]

**Sent:** Thursday, April 30, 2020 3:46 PM

To: Raynor, Christopher

**Subject:** Regional Council Composition, Regional Fire Service

Good afternoon Mr. Raynor.

Please be advised that Town Council, at its April 22<sup>nd</sup> Council meeting, considered a request by the Region concerning a Regional Fire Service and passed the following motion:

#### **RESOLUTION NO. C-2020-0105**

Moved By Regional Councillor Grossi Seconded By Councillor Neeson

That Town Council reaffirm its February 5, 2020 position requesting York Region to investigate and report back to each of the nine municipalities on the potential of uploading fire services and consolidate the fire service at the Regional level, and that said action involve all York Region municipalities, the Georgina Fire Chief, representatives of all municipal Professional Fire Fighters Associations within York Region and the Chippewas of Georgina Island First Nation.

#### Carried.

Additionally, Town Council considered a Briefing Note from the Town Clerk concerning Regional Council Composition and passed the following motion:

#### **RESOLUTION NO. C-2020-0114**

Moved By Regional Councillor Grossi Seconded By Councillor Neeson

That Council receive the Briefing Note from the Town Clerk concerning Regional Council Composition and consent to increasing the number of members from the City of Vaughan four (4) to five (5).

#### Carried

Sincerely,



Carolyn Lance
Council Services Coordinator
Clerk's Division | Town of Georgina
26557 Civic Centre Road, Keswick, ON | L4P 3G1
905-476-4301 Ext. 2219 | georgina.ca
Follow us on Twitter and Instagram, like us on Facebook



King Township 2585 King Road King City , Ontario Canada L7B Phone: 905.833.5321 Fax: 905.833.2300 Website: www.king.ca Email: ServiceKing.ca

via email: christopher.raynor@york.ca

May 5, 2020

Chris Raynor, Regional Clerk Regional Municipality of York 17250 Yonge Street NEWMARKET ON L3Y 6Z1

Dear Mr. Raynor,

RE: Correspondence Received from York Region

Motion – Study on Potential Creation of a Regional Fire Service

At its meeting of May 4, 2020, Council received the correspondence from the Regional Municipality of York with respect to the Motion to consider a study on the potential of a Regional Fire Service and unanimously approved the following recommendations, as amended;

- That Council receive the correspondence from the Regional Municipality of York;
   and
- b) That Council <u>not support</u> the Regional Municipality of York on proceeding with a study on the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service; and
- c) That the Clerk notifies the Regional Clerk of Council's decision by May 29, 2020.

Yours truly,

Kathryn Moyle

Director of Clerks/By-law Enforcement

Township Clerk

cc. Jim Wall, Fire Chief/CEMC, King (jwall@king.ca)



May 20, 2020

Chris Raynor Regional Clerk 17250 Yonge Street Newmarket, ON L3Y 6Z1

**RE:** RESPONSE TO YORK REGION – FIRE REGIONALIZATION (7.15)

Dear Mr. Raynor;

This will confirm that at a meeting held May 12, 2020, the Council of the City of Markham adopted the following resolution:

- 1. That Council not support proceeding with a Regional Fire Service study; and,
- 2. That Staff recommend that we continue current efforts with Richmond Hill and Vaughan, in particular the creation of a shared communications centre that will enable further joint/shared opportunities to achieve efficiencies and to improve services to our residents and businesses.

Yours sincerely,

Kimberley Kitteringham City Clerk

Attachment 1

Attachment 2

cc: M. Pettit



Kiran Saini
Deputy Town Clerk
Town of Newmarket
395 Mulock Drive
P.O. Box 328 Station Main
Newmarket, ON L3Y 4X7

ksaini@newmarket.ca tel.: 905-953-5300, Ext. 2203

fax: 905-953-5100

May 27, 2020

Sent via email to: regional.clerk@york.ca

Attn: Chris Raynor, Regional Clerk

## RE: Regional Council Decision regarding Regional Fire Services

I am writing to advise you that at the Special Electronic Council meeting held on May 19, 2020, Council adopted the following recommendations regarding the above referenced matter:

- 1. That the correspondence from York Region regarding Regional Fire Services be received for information; and,
- 2. That the report entitled Regional Fire Services Study dated May 19, 2020 be received; and,
- 3. That the Town of Newmarket support participation in a Regional Fire study, if all nine York Region Municipalities endorse the undertaking of the study; and,
- 4. That Council's decision be forwarded to York Region; and,
- 5. That Staff be authorized and directed to do all things necessary to give effect to this resolution.

Yours sincerely,

Kiran Saini Deputy Town Clerk

KS:aw

Cc: Clerkgeneralline@york.ca



# Office of the City Manager Office of the City Clerk

Email: regionalclerk@york.ca

April 14, 2020

Christopher Raynor, Regional Clerk Regional Municipality of York 17250 Yonge Street Newmarket, ON L3Y 6Z1

Dear Mr. Raynor:

Re: Richmond Hill Resolution - Consolidation of Regional Fire Services - Consent to a Study

Richmond Hill City Council, at its meeting held on April 8, 2020, adopted the following recommendations:

- a) That Council for the City of Richmond Hill supports proceeding with a study on the potential of a Regional Fire Services;
- b) That the City Clerk be directed to forward a copy of Council's resolution to the Regional Clerk.
- c) That staff be directed to report to Council on any results of the Regional study on the potential of a Regional Fire Services, including any implications for Richmond Hill.

In accordance with Council's directive, please find attached a copy Staff Report SRCM.20.06 regarding Consolidation of Regional Fire Services – Consent to a Study.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at (905) 771-2529.

Yours sincerely,

Stephen M.A. Huycke

Director of Legislative Services/City Clerk

Attachment

#### **CITY OF VAUGHAN**

# **EXTRACT FROM COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 21, 2020**

Item 6, Report No. 17, of the Committee of the Whole, which was adopted without amendment by the Council of the City of Vaughan on April 21, 2020.

# 6. STUDY OF POTENTIAL REGIONALIZATION OF YORK REGION FIRE SERVICE

The Committee of the Whole recommends:

- 1) That the City of Vaughan does not support the study to determine the potential amalgamation of all eight York Region Fire Services within the nine York Region municipalities;
- 2) That the recommendation 2. contained in the following report of the Deputy City Manager, Community Services, dated April 21, 2020, be approved; and
- 3) That Communication C3, memorandum from the Fire Chief, Vaughan Fire and Rescue Service, dated April 20, 2020, be received.

#### Recommendations

- 1. That Council consider supporting a study to determine the potential amalgamation of all eight York Region Fire Services within the nine York Region municipalities; and
- 2. That Council's decision be forwarded by the City Clerk to The Regional Municipality of York.



# Committee of the Whole (2) Report

**DATE:** Tuesday, April 21, 2020 **WARD(S):** ALL

# TITLE: STUDY OF POTENTIAL REGIONALIZATION OF YORK REGION FIRE SERVICE

#### FROM:

Mary Reali, Deputy City Manager, Community Services

**ACTION:** DECISION

## **Purpose**

To seek Council's consideration to support a study for the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service as requested by the Regional Municipality of York.

# **Report Highlights**

- Regionalization of fire services in the Regional Municipality of York (York Region) has been considered and studied several times since 1996.
- Vaughan Council is being requested to determine whether the study of a regional fire service is warranted.

# Recommendations

- That Council consider supporting a study to determine the potential amalgamation of all eight York Region Fire Services within the nine York Region municipalities; and
- 2. That Council's decision be forwarded by the City Clerk to The Regional Municipality of York.

# **Background**

At its meeting of February 27, 2020, York Region Council adopted the following motion:

WHEREAS the consolidation of Aurora and Newmarket fire services into Central York Fire Service has resulted in efficiencies through enhanced levels of fire service and cost efficiencies;

WHEREAS a Regional Fire Service may achieve further operating efficiencies, improved department structure, increased service level(s), and cost avoidance opportunities;

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Regional Clerk share this motion with local municipal Councils requesting a resolution by May 29, 2020 indicating whether they support proceeding with a study on the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service.

In an effort to consider the most efficient and effective ways of delivering vital services to City of Vaughan residents, a recommendation from Regional Council has been proposed to study the regionalization of eight fire services in York Region within the nine York Region municipalities.

In 1996 and again in 2002, regionalization in York Region was considered at a number of levels; including (1) a regional model which envisaged local fire departments consolidated into one regional fire service, (2) a regional fully integrated model which included the ambulance service with the regional fire service model, (3) a regional/local model which included communications (dispatch), training, fire prevention and maintenance combined at a regional level, with fire suppression and emergency response remaining at a local level incorporating automatic aid (City of Vaughan 1996).

The proposed study will review financial implications (including collection of development charges and cost avoidances), the governance model, labour implications, standardization of fire prevention, public education and training, standards of cover, key findings and other service delivery impacts.

York Region fire services have long standing **mutual aid agreements** (with no additional cost) in place when there is a surge in required suppression response.

# **Consultant Reports - Key Points**

The summary below outlines the key points from various reports, including consultant's reports since 1997.

# 1997 ARA Consultants Group/Tri Data Corporation (ARA):

 The recommended structure for the consolidation of fire services in York Region was the Urban-Rural option which consolidated the urban fire departments of

- Markham, Vaughan, Richmond Hill, Aurora, and Newmarket into one fire department and leaves the rural fire services in their current configuration.
- Operational and financial advantages were identified that would result from the consolidation of fire services.
- Human resources implications could have a negative impact on the use of volunteers in the rural areas.

#### Two options for a governance model:

- a) Use of a joint fire service board was recommended in the ARA study as the governance model for the consolidated urban fire department;
- b) Delegate the responsibility for the consolidated fire department to the Region and the Region would assume full authority and accountability for the delivery of the services.

At the April 10, 1997 meeting Regional Council endorsed the recommendations of the ARA study and referred the report to the area municipalities for consideration and development of implementation plans.

### 2001 Report No. 1 of the Regional Fire Services Committee:

- A recommendation to provide the Regional Municipality of York with the authority and accountability of the consolidated fire services which would serve all the residents of York Region.
- ARA projected that the Fully Consolidated option would start to accrue savings
  after the first year, mainly due to lower staff requirements in the areas of fire
  suppression, communications and administration.
- The recommendations identified in the 1997 ARA study to consolidate fire services are still valid.

#### 2002 Consolidations of Newmarket and Aurora Fire Services:

- Central York Fire Services (CYFS) was formed by the consolidation of Newmarket and Aurora Fire Departments.
- Richmond Hill withdrew from discussions due to anticipated decrease in service levels.
- Additional concerns by Richmond Hill included potential increase in compensation and benefits, and the collection and use of development charges should they consolidate with other municipalities.

# 2013 Vaughan Council Meeting of April 23, 2013 (CW, Report 14, Item 35):

 That the City of Vaughan study and conduct a pilot project for a two-year period to implement automatic aid, being reciprocal fire, rescue, and emergency response support, with the City of Markham and the Town of Richmond Hill in response to emergencies.

## 2016 Dillon Consulting – Study for Richmond Hill Fire consolidating with CYFS:

- Limited opportunity to reduce already constrained staff resources.
- Opportunity for one Fire Chief (cost savings).
- Opportunity to increase non-unionized positions.
- Limited short-term opportunity to save money through staggered hiring of fire prevention staffing.
- Some opportunity for cost savings, enhanced flexibility for scheduling training and more training opportunities in the Training Division.
- No operational improvement for initial response capabilities in any of the municipalities.
- Limited depth of response improvement along the Richmond Hill/Aurora municipal border.
- Potential loss in revenue as CYFS contracts RHFS to provide their dispatch in the Communications Division.
- Additional costs required to standardize equipment.

# May 2019 Finance, Administration and Audit Committee (FAA) - Provincial Regional Government Review Maintaining the City of Vaughan's Existing Governance Framework:

 Scenario 1: Amalgamation, the creation of One Single-Tier municipality for all of York Region (p.20). The analysis would suggest the potential to achieve significant cost savings over the medium to long-term for Fire Services.

There are opportunities to explore changes to the delivery of fire services. Aurora and Newmarket currently have a joint-fire service. Vaughan has had initial discussions with Markham and Richmond Hill on opportunities to leverage joint purchasing, joint training and an option of combining a communication centre.

# **Previous Reports/Authority**

1997 ARA Consultants Group/Tri Data Corporation

Report No. 1 of the Regional 9-1-1 Operating Committee Meeting held on March 7, 2001

Report No. 2 of the Regional 9-1-1 Operating Committee Meeting held on May 31, 2001

<u>Deputation of the Region of York for the Establishment of a Steering Committee</u> (2011)

Ottawa Community and Protective Services Committee, June 23, 2011.

**Vaughan Council Meeting Minutes of April 23, 2013** 

Markham Fire Services Automatic Aid Pilot Project with the City of Vaughan and the Town of Richmond Hill May 27, 2013

Richmond Hill Staff Report for Fire Consolidation Study Council Advisory Committee Meeting October 25, 2016

Richmond Hill Staff Report for Fire Consolidation Study Council Advisory
Committee April 18, 2018

Regional Governance Review – City of Vaughan and York Region Fiscal Impact

Analysis

Review of Regional Government - Scenario Impact Analysis

# **Analysis and Options**

Historically there have been several studies conducted in York Region, and Vaughan Council will determine whether further investigations will yield different results, whereby the potential improvements to service levels outweighs the financial costs. The Fire Services in York Region have a track record for collaboration to ensure efficiencies are realized by the separate entities, and a decision is required to be made on whether a study is required to determine if additional benefits could be realized by the regionalization of the fire services within York Region.

- a) City of Vaughan Council will determine if there is support to study the benefits of a consolidated fire service in York Region.
- Vaughan Council's resolution will be forwarded by the Clerk to the Regional Council.

# Financial Impact

The Region has not advised of any potential financial implications for the City of Vaughan related to the proposed study of the regional consolidation of fire services.

# **Broader Regional Impacts/Considerations**

There are a number of implications to any establishment of regional service. If there is a support for regionalization of fire services, items that must be considered are: the type of taxation and its equality, political accountability, service levels, feasibility, resource utilization and distribution, standardization, economies of scale, labour relations, and standards of cover.

## Conclusion

Although a Regional Fire Service has not been understudied, it has been some time since a regional study has been performed. From a City of Vaughan perspective, the growth and addition of infrastructure like the Vaughan Metropolitan Centre (VMC) and Mackenzie Vaughan Hospital have created future challenges that this and future Councils will continue to face. If a study was to be performed, a portion of the scope should be ensuring current investments (personnel and equipment) will remain with those municipalities who have shown leadership in providing investment and planning for a particular level resourcing and service level.

## **Attachments**

None

# **Prepared by**

Deryn Rizzi, Fire Chief, Vaughan Fire & Rescue Service, ext. 6301



111 Sandiford Drive, Stouffville, ON L4A 0Z8

Customer Service Centre: 905-640-1900 Toll Free: 1-855-642-TOWN (8696)

**Automated:** 905-640-1910 Toll Free: 1-855-642-TOWS (8697)

Fax: 905-640-7957 www.townofws.ca

#### VIA Email < regional.clerk@york.ca>

April 16, 2020

The Regional Municipality of York 17250 Yonge Street Newmarket, ON L3Y 6Z1

#### **RE: Regional Fire Service**

Please be advised the above-noted matter was placed before Council at its meeting held on April 7, 2020, and the following resolution was passed:

1) That Council support proceeding with a study on the potential creation of a Regional Fire Service.

Carried

Regarding the above-noted matter, Council at its meeting held on April 7, 2020, also passed the following resolution:

1) That Council support a Regional Automatic Aid Agreement by neighbouring Regional municipalities.

Carried

Yours truly.

Kristina Soolepp, Council Coordinator (905) 642-4130

cc. City of Markham
City of Richmond Hill
City of Vaughan
Town of Aurora
Town of East Gwillimbury
Town of Georgina
Town of Newmarket
Township of King