

The Regional Municipality of York

Committee of the Whole
Transportation Services
February 11, 2021

Report of the Commissioner of Transportation Services

Award of Consulting Engineering Services for Stouffville Road Bayview Avenue to Highway 404 City of Richmond Hill

1. Recommendations

1. Council approve award of contract for consulting engineering services for Stouffville Road (Y.R. 14), from Bayview Avenue (Y.R. 34) to Highway 404, in the City of Richmond Hill, to AECOM Canada Ltd., pursuant to Request for Proposal P-20-210, at a total cost of \$2,357,229.34, excluding HST.
2. The Commissioner of Transportation Services be authorized to execute the contract on behalf of the Region.

2. Summary

This report seeks Council approval to award the contract to AECOM Canada Ltd. for consulting engineering services for the detailed design of Stouffville Road improvements, from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404, under Request for Proposal (RFP) P-20-210.

The Region's current Purchasing Bylaw (2017-30) requires Council authorization to award RFPs where the total cost exceeds \$2,000,000.

Key Points:

- Widening and reconstruction of Stouffville Road, from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404, is programmed to begin in 2025
- The realignment of Leslie Street in the vicinity of Stouffville Road will also be included as part of the Stouffville Road improvements project
- Request for Pre-Qualification (RFPQ) PQ-20-70 was completed and three consultants were invited to submit proposals for the detailed design assignment under Request for Proposal (RFP) P-20-210
- The proposal submitted by AECOM Canada Ltd. achieved the lowest cost per technical point and as such is the successful proponent pursuant to the requirements of the RFP and the terms of the Region's Purchasing Bylaw

3. Background

A Class Environmental Assessment study for Stouffville Road from Yonge Street to Highway 404 was completed in November 2017

A Class Environmental Assessment (EA) study was initiated in November 2014 to review the Stouffville Road from Yonge Street to Highway 404 as recommended in the Transportation Master Plan.

The EA study completed in November 2017 recommended Stouffville Road be widened to four lanes incorporating active transportation facilities.

Widening and reconstruction of Stouffville Road, from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404, is programmed to begin in 2025

As identified in the Region's 2020 10-Year Roads and Transit Capital Construction Program, the Region is planning to widen and reconstruct the section of Stouffville Road from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404 beginning in 2025. This section has been prioritized as it serves the Gormley GO station and provides access to and from Highway 404. The realignment and jog elimination of Leslie Street in the vicinity of Stouffville Road will also be included as part of the Stouffville Road assignment.

Therefore, the Region needs to procure the services of a design consultant to undertake the detailed design of this project.

4. Analysis

The Region issued a Request for Pre-Qualification for detailed design and engineering services for various road improvement projects

In May 2020, Request for Pre-Qualification PQ-20-70 was issued for eight assignments, including the detailed design of Stouffville Road improvements from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404. Twenty-three firms expressed interest. The submissions were evaluated in August 2020 and the top six firms were pre-qualified:

- AECOM Canada Ltd.
- CIMA Canada Inc.
- Parsons Inc.
- SNC Lavalin Inc.
- Stantec Consulting Ltd.
- WSP Canada Group Limited

As outlined in the pre-qualification document, three of the six pre-qualified firms were invited to submit a proposal for this assignment and the remaining three pre-qualified firms will be invited to submit a proposal for other assignments.

The three firms invited to submit a proposal for this assignment are:

- AECOM Canada Ltd.
- CIMA Canada Inc.
- SNC Lavalin Inc.

September 2020, the Region issued a Request for Proposal for detailed design and engineering services for Stouffville Road improvements, from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404

In September 2020, RFP P-20-210 was issued to three pre-qualified proponents and all three submitted proposals. The request for proposal procurement approach was determined to be appropriate given the importance of assessing the proponent's understanding of the work, the Region's requirements and expectations, and the proponent's proposed method of delivering the work. A request for tender is the preferred procurement approach for work where the tasks, deliverables and approach are clearly defined and where the contract is awarded to the lowest cost responsive bidder.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system with a weighting of 80% for the technical component and 20% for the financial component. The proponents had to achieve a minimum score of 48 points out of 80 in the technical component to proceed to the next step of having their financial envelopes opened. All three firms met this criterion.

The Region's proposal evaluation team reviewed the technical proposals based on the evaluation criteria listed in P-20-210. Including:

- A thorough understanding of the overall project requirements identifying the key design challenges, project risks and deliverables
- Identifying/engaging the project stakeholders and minimizing impacts to the public
- Their understanding of the project schedule taking into account, not only the design deliverables, but acquisition of property, relocation of utilities and acquisition of permits and agreements
- Their ability to manage the overall project to meet the Region's timelines and provide quality deliverables in a timely manner

The proposals were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, bylaws and practices. The proponents, their technical and financial scores and proposed upset limit fees are shown in Table 1.

Table 1
Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (80%)	Financial Score (20%)	Total Score (100%)	Upset Limit Fee (excluding HST)	Cost per Technical Point
AECOM Canada Ltd.	53.01	20.00	73.01	\$2,357,229.34	\$44,467.64
SNC Lavalin Inc.	63.19	13.70	76.89	\$3,440,412.14	\$54,449.82
CIMA Canada Inc.	48.96	17.79	66.75	\$2,649,997.01	

The proposal from AECOM Canada Ltd. achieved the lowest cost per technical point in response to Request for Proposal P-20-210

Through the evaluation of the technical proposals, SNC Lavalin Inc. received a higher technical score compared to the other two proponents as they demonstrated a better understanding of the project and presented a comprehensive approach to undertake the work. However, SNC Lavalin Inc. also submitted a much higher price compared to the other two proponents to undertake the assignment and provide the same deliverables to the Region.

Although the proposal from SNC Lavalin received the highest technical score and overall total score, the proposal from AECOM Canada achieved the lowest cost per technical point. The terms of the RFP state where two or more bidders are within five points of the highest total score, a cost per technical point methodology shall be applied to determine the proponent to whom the contract shall be awarded. As such, AECOM Canada Ltd. is the successful proponent pursuant to the requirements of the RFP and the Region’s Purchasing Bylaw.

While AECOM Canada Ltd. did not score as well on the technical component of the RFP, they were pre-qualified, met the technical requirements and are considered capable of delivering this work.

5. Financial

The upset limit fee submitted by AECOM Canada Ltd. for consulting engineering services is \$2,357,229, excluding HST.

Funds are available in the approved 2020 Capital Budget. All expenditures for this assignment will be funded from 90% development charges and 10% tax levy.

6. Local Impact

The design assignment should have minimal impact on local businesses, traffic and pedestrians. The impacts will be limited to short duration lane closures for short-term, pre-construction field investigation work.

Throughout the course of this assignment, Regional staff will work with staff from the City of Richmond Hill and the Ministry of Transportation to address any local municipal infrastructure requirements.

7. Conclusion

Proposals from the three firms were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, bylaws and practices. The proposal submitted by AECOM Canada Ltd. achieved the lowest cost per technical point and is the successful proponent pursuant to the requirements of the RFP and the terms of the Region's Purchasing Bylaw.

It is recommended the contract for consulting engineering services for the detailed design of Stouffville Road improvements, from Bayview Avenue to Highway 404, be awarded to AECOM Canada, as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-20-210, for a total cost of \$2,357,229.34, excluding HST.

For more information on this report, please contact Salim Alibhai, Director of Capital Planning and Delivery at 1-877-464-9675 ext. 75229. Accessible formats or communication supports are available upon request.

Recommended by:



Paul Jankowski
Commissioner of Transportation Services

Approved for Submission:



Bruce Macgregor
Chief Administrative Officer

January 22, 2021
Attachment (1)
11486690